

U.S. District Court
Eastern District of New York (Brooklyn)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML

Riverkeeper, Inc. et al v. Exxon Mobil Corporation
Assigned to: Judge Carol B. Amon
Referred to: Magistrate-Judge Robert M. Levy
Member case: ([View Member Case](#))
other Case: [1:07-cv-02902-CBA-RML](#)
related Cases: [1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML](#)
[1:06-cv-02865-CBA-RML](#)

Date Filed: 05/18/2004
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 893 Environmental
Matters
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Cause: 33:1365 Environmental Matters

Plaintiff

Riverkeeper, Inc.

represented by **Daniel E. Estrin**
Pace Environmental Litigation Clinic,
Inc.
78 North Broadway, E House
White Plains, NY 10603
914-422-4343
Email: destrin@law.pace.edu
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Karl Stephen Coplan
Pace Environmental Litigation Clinic
78 North Broadway
White Plains, NY 10603
914-422-4343
Fax: 914-422-4437
Email: kcoplan@law.pace.edu
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Rolf Carle

represented by **Daniel E. Estrin**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Karl Stephen Coplan
(See above for address)

Plaintiff

Laura Hoffman

represented by **Daniel E. Estrin**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Karl Stephen Coplan
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Deborah Masters

represented by **Daniel E. Estrin**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Karl Stephen Coplan
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

William Schuck

represented by **Daniel E. Estrin**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Karl Stephen Coplan
(See above for address)

Plaintiff

Teresa Toro

represented by **Daniel E. Estrin**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Karl Stephen Coplan

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Exxon Mobil Corporation

represented by **Brian A. McGill**

McDermott, Will & Emery

600 13th Street, N.W.

Washington, DC 20005

(202) 756-8000

Fax: 202-756-8087

Email: bmcgill@mwe.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ellen S Tenenbaum

McDermott Will & Emery

600 13th Street NW

Washington1, DC 20005

202-756-8000

Fax: 202-756-8087

Email: etenenbaum@mwe.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John J. Calandra

McDermott, Will & Emery, LLP

340 Madison Avenue

New York, NY 10017

(212)547-5000

Fax: (212)547-5444

Email: jcalandra@mwe.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sarah E. Hancur

McDermott Will & Emery LLP

600 Thirteenth Street, N.W.

12th Floor

Washington, DC 20005-3096
(202)756-8093
Fax: (202)756-8087
Email: shancur@mwe.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David O'Neal Crump
McDermott Will & Emery LLP
600 13th Street, N.W
Washington, DC 20005-3096
202.756.8000
Fax: 202.756.8087
Email: dcrump@mwe.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael Denis Hall
McDermott Will & Emery LLP
340 Madison Avenue
New York, NY 10017
(212)547-5553
Fax: (212)547-5444
Email: mhall@mwe.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Stephen Joseph Riccardulli
McDermott, Will & Emery
50 Rockefeller Plaza
New York, NY 10020
(212)547-5400
Fax: (212)547-5444
Email: sriccardulli@mwe.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
05/18/2004	1	COMPLAINT Summons Issued against Exxon Mobil Corporation filing fee \$ 150, receipt number 294161, filed by Rolf Carle, Laura Hoffman, Deborah Masters, Riverkeeper, Inc., William Schuck, Teresa Toro. (Attachments: # 1 Civil Cover Sheet)(Villanueva, William) (Entered: 05/20/2004)
05/18/2004		Summons Issued as to Exxon Mobil Corporation. (Villanueva,

		William) (Entered: 05/20/2004)
07/09/2004	2	ORDER GRANTING DFT EXXONMOBIL'S UNOPPOSED MOTION TO EXTEND TIME TO ANSWER OR OTHERWISE RESPOND TO THE COMPLAINT: Ordered that dft ExxonMobil shall have until 8/4/04, to serve its answer or otherwise respond to plts' complaint. Attached, Unopposed Motion to Extend Time to Answer or Otherwise Respond to the Complaint. Signed by Judge I. Leo Glasser on 7/9/04. (Nieves, Adrian) (Entered: 07/13/2004)
08/05/2004		Case reassigned to Judge Carol B. Amon. Judge I. Leo Glasser no longer assigned to the case. Parties notified. (Bowens, Priscilla) (Entered: 08/10/2004)
08/06/2004	3	STIPULATION AND ORDER granting stay of all proceedings in this action until 10/01/04. Signed by Judge Roanne L. Mann on 08/06/04. (Maynard, Pat) (Entered: 08/06/2004)
08/11/2004	4	Letter dtd 8/6/04 from Ellen Tenenbaum to Mr. Heinemann, informing the court of the stipulation seeking stay of proceedings in this case. Stipulation attached. (Copy forwarded to chambers) (Sica, Michele) (Entered: 08/13/2004)
08/11/2004	5	STIPULATION Suspending Litigation by Riverkeeper, Inc. (copy forwarded to chambers). (Sica, Michele) (Entered: 08/13/2004)
08/16/2004		ENDORSED ORDER, on the Stipulation Suspending Litigation. (see doc # 5) . Signed by Judge Roanne L. Mann on 8/6/04. (Sica, Michele) (Entered: 08/16/2004)
08/20/2004	6	STIPULATION AND ORDER SUSPENDING LITIGATION. All proceedings shall be stayed until 10/1/04. Signed by Judge Carol B. Amon on 8/17/04. (Permaul, Jenny) (Entered: 08/20/2004)
09/29/2004	8	Motion To Admit Counsel Pro Hac Vice filed by Exxon Mobil Corporation. (w/Affidavit of Peter John Sacripanti In Support of Motion). (Layne, Monique) (Entered: 10/07/2004)
09/29/2004		CASE FILING FEE: \$ 50.00, receipt number 299992 re: Motion To Admit Brian A. McGill and Ellen S. Tenenbaum as attorneys Pro Hac Vice in this case matter. (Layne, Monique)) (Entered: 10/07/2004)
10/06/2004	7	SECOND STIPULATION SUSPENDING LITIGATION: Pltffs, Deft, and Peerless Importers, Inc., by and through undersigned counsel, HEREBY AGREE: that all proceedings in this action shall be stayed until 11/15/04. (See doc. for further details). SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Carol B. Amon on 10/1/04). C/M by chambers.(Layne, Monique) (Entered: 10/06/2004)
10/07/2004	9	ORDER: granting 8 Motion to Substitute Attorney. The admitted attys,

		McGill and Tenenbaum, are permitted to argue or try this case in whole or in part as counsel. (Signed by Judge Carol B. Amon on 10/1/04). C/M by chambers. (Layne, Monique) (Entered: 10/07/2004)
11/12/2004	10	STIPULATION (<i>3rd Suspending Litigation</i>) by Teresa Toro, Exxon Mobil Corporation, Riverkeeper, Inc., Rolf Carle, Laura Hoffman, Deborah Masters, William Schuck. (Coplan, Karl) (Entered: 11/12/2004)
11/22/2004		ORDER re 10 Third Stipulation Suspending Litigation filed by Exxon Mobil Corporation, Riverkeeper, Inc., Rolf Carle, Laura Hoffman, Deborah Masters, William Schuck, and Teresa Toro. So Ordered. Signed by Judge Carol B. Amon on 11/19/04. (Liberatore, Marie) (Entered: 11/22/2004)
01/13/2005	11	STIPULATION <i>Suspending Litigation</i> by Exxon Mobil Corporation. (Tenenbaum, Ellen) (Entered: 01/13/2005)
01/21/2005		ORDER re 11 Fourth Stipulation Suspending Litigation filed by Exxon Mobil Corporation. So Ordered. Signed by Judge Carol B. Amon on 1/20/05. (Liberatore, Marie) (Entered: 01/21/2005)
02/28/2005	12	STIPULATION <i>Suspending Litigation</i> by Exxon Mobil Corporation. (Tenenbaum, Ellen) (Entered: 02/28/2005)
03/01/2005		ORDER re 12 Fifth Stipulation Suspending Litigation until May 2, 2005 filed by Exxon Mobil Corporation. So Ordered. Signed by Judge Carol B. Amon on 3/1/05. (Amon, Carol) (Entered: 03/01/2005)
04/27/2005	13	STIPULATION <i>Suspending Litigation</i> by Exxon Mobil Corporation. (Tenenbaum, Ellen) (Entered: 04/27/2005)
04/28/2005		ORDER re 13 SIXTH STIPULATION SUSPENDING LITIGATION filed by Exxon Mobil Corporation. Ordered by Judge Carol B. Amon on 4/28/05. (Liberatore, Marie) (Entered: 04/28/2005)
06/28/2005	14	STIPULATION <i>Seventh Stipulation Suspending Litigation</i> by Exxon Mobil Corporation. (Tenenbaum, Ellen) (Entered: 06/28/2005)
06/28/2005	15	ORDER: Seventh stipulation suspending litigation. All agree this action shall be stayed until 9/7/05; that this stay will not prejudice the position of any party with respect to the above cited action; that throughout the stay no party shall file any related summons, etc. against any party to this stipulation; and that following the expiration of the stay, in the event Peerless Importers, Inc. named as a party to this action or a related proceeding, Peerless Importers, Inc. shall not assert any defense that would not have been available to it had such claim been issued on the date of this stipulation. So Ordered by MJ Roanne L. Mann on 6/28/05. (Mann, Roanne) (Entered: 06/28/2005)

09/02/2005	16	STIPULATION <i>Suspending Litigation</i> by Exxon Mobil Corporation. (Tenenbaum, Ellen) (Entered: 09/02/2005)
09/02/2005	17	AMENDED DOCUMENT by Exxon Mobil Corporation. Amendment to 16 Stipulation <i>due to an error in the Certificate of Service</i> . (Tenenbaum, Ellen) Additional attachment(s) added on 9/8/2005 (Glenn, Marilyn). (Entered: 09/02/2005)
09/09/2005		Notice to Counsel: Endorsed order attached to document #17. (Glenn, Marilyn) (Entered: 09/09/2005)
11/04/2005	18	ANSWER to Complaint by Exxon Mobil Corporation.(Tenenbaum, Ellen) (Entered: 11/04/2005)
11/07/2005	19	SCHEDULING ORDER: Initial Conference set for 12/15/2005 03:30 PM in Courtroom B before Magistrate-Judge Roanne L. Mann. Ordered by Judge Roanne L. Mann on 11/07/05. (Maynard, Pat) (Entered: 11/07/2005)
11/10/2005		Per MJ Mann's 11/9/05 e-mail of recusal: Mag. Judge Robert M. Levy added. Mag. Judge Roanne L. Mann no longer assigned to case. (Vaughn, Terry) (Entered: 11/10/2005)
11/14/2005	20	ORDER. The above-captioned case has been reassigned to Magistrate Judge Levy for pretrial supervision. Therefore, the December 15th initial conference before the undersigned magistrate judge is cancelled. Ordered by Judge Roanne L. Mann on 11/14/05. (Shindel, Cory) (Entered: 11/14/2005)
11/15/2005		SCHEDULING ORDER:A conference has been scheduled for December 21, 2005 at 2:00 p.m., before the Honorable Robert Levy, United States Magistrate Judge in Courtroom 619 at 225 Cadman Plaza East, Brooklyn, New York. Plaintiffs' counsel is requested to confirm with defendants' counsel that all necessary participants are aware of this conference. No request for adjournment will be considered unless made at least forty-eight (48) hours before the scheduled conference. Ordered by Judge Robert M. Levy on 11/15/05. Related to 05 CV 5055 (CBA)(RML)and 05 CV 5229 (CBA)(RML)(Marino, Janine) (Entered: 11/15/2005)
12/21/2005		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Robert M. Levy: Carl Coplan, Erin Flanagan, Riverkeeper plaintiffs; Matthew Brinckerhoff, Markowitz plaintiffs; Ellen Tennenbaum, Joe Walsh, ExxonMobil. Scheduling order adopted, with the following modification: The deadline for plaintiffs to add necessary parties or for ExxonMobil to join third-party defendants is April 28, 2006, or, if a joinder motion is filed, 30 days after a ruling on the joinder motion. Initial disclosures and the time to answer the complaint in the Markowitz case: January

		10, 2006. Next conference: March 9, 2006 at 2:15. Initial Conference Hearing held on 12/21/2005. (Levy, Robert) (Entered: 12/21/2005)
01/04/2006	21	PROPOSED SCHEDULING ORDER: Fact Discovery due by 9/29/2006. Joinder of Parties due by 3/31/2006. Motions due by 5/14/2007. Rule 26 Exchange due by 12/14/2005. Ordered by Judge Robert M. Levy on 12/21/05. (Permaul, Jenny) (Entered: 01/04/2006)
01/11/2006		Email Notification Test - DO NOT REPLY (Lee, Tiffeny) (Entered: 01/11/2006)
03/06/2006	22	First MOTION to Adjourn Conference <i>Scheduled for March 9, 2006</i> by all plaintiffs. (Coplan, Karl) (Entered: 03/06/2006)
03/07/2006		ORDER re 22 First MOTION to Adjourn Conference Scheduled for March 9, 2006 filed by Riverkeeper, Inc., et al., APPLICATION GRANTED. The conference is adjourned to MAY 4, 2006 @ 11:30 AM.. Ordered by Judge Robert M. Levy on 3/7/06. (Marino, Janine) (Entered: 03/07/2006)
03/29/2006	23	MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Motion for Joinder of Necessary Parties</i> by Exxon Mobil Corporation. (Tenenbaum, Ellen) (Entered: 03/29/2006)
03/31/2006		ORDER re 23 MOTION for Extension of Time to File Motion for Joinder of Necessary Parties filed by Exxon Mobil Corporation. APPLICATION GRANTED. Ordered by Judge Robert M. Levy on 3/31/06. (Marino, Janine) (Entered: 03/31/2006)
04/17/2006	24	MOTION for Joinder by Exxon Mobil Corporation. (Attachments: # 1 Request for Judicial Notice in Support of Motion to Compel the Joinder of Certain Necessary Parties Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. 19# 2 Memorandum of Law in Support of Exxon Mobil Corporation's Motion to Compel the Joinder of Certain Necessary Parties Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. 19# 3 Declaration of Brian A. McGill in Support of Exxon Mobil Corporation's Motion to Compel the Joinder of Certain Necessary Parties Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 19# 4 McGill Declaration Exhibit A# 5 McGill Declaration Exhibit B# 6 McGill Declaration Exhibit C# 7 McGill Declaration Exhibit D# 8 McGill Declaration Exhibit E# 9 McGill Declaration Exhibit F# 10 Certificate of Service)(Riccardulli, Stephen) (Entered: 04/17/2006)
04/24/2006		Motions terminated: 23 MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Motion for Joinder of Necessary Parties</i> filed by Exxon Mobil Corporation,, 22 First MOTION to Adjourn Conference <i>Scheduled for March 9, 2006</i> filed by Riverkeeper, Inc.,, Rolf Carle,, Laura Hoffman,, Deborah Masters,, William Schuck,, Teresa Toro., (Permaul, Jenny) (Entered: 04/24/2006)

05/04/2006	25	ORDER REFERRING MOTION: 24 MOTION for Joinder filed by Exxon Mobil Corporation is hereby referred to United States Magistrate Judge Levy for report and recommendation. So Ordered by Judge Carol B. Amon on 5/4/06. (Liberatore, Marie) (Entered: 05/04/2006)
05/04/2006		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Robert M. Levy: Karl S. Coplan, Daniel E. Estrin, Riverkeeper plaintiffs; Matthew Brinckerhoff, Markowitz plaintiffs; Ellen Tennenbaum, Michael Hall, defendant. Cases 04 CV 2056 and 05 CV 5229 are consolidated for discovery. The parties shall confer on a briefing schedule for the joinder motions and advise the court forthwith. Oral argument on the motions will be held 7/13/06 at 11:00. Status Conference held on 5/4/2006. (Levy, Robert) (Entered: 05/04/2006)
05/16/2006	26	Letter to Hon. Robert M. Levy re: Joinder Motion Briefing Schedule by Teresa Toro, Riverkeeper, Inc., Rolf Carle, Laura Hoffman, Deborah Masters, William Schuck. Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML,1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML(Coplan, Karl) (Entered: 05/16/2006)
05/22/2006	27	First MOTION for Leave to File <i>Hard Copy of Exhibit Under Seal in Response to Motion to Compel Joinder</i> by all plaintiffs. Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML,1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML(Coplan, Karl) (Entered: 05/22/2006)
05/23/2006	28	NOTICE of Appearance by Daniel Eric Estrin on behalf of all plaintiffs Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML,1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML(Estrin, Daniel) (Entered: 05/23/2006)
05/26/2006		NOTICE of Appearance by Daniel E. Estrin on behalf of Teresa Toro, Riverkeeper, Inc., Rolf Carle, Laura Hoffman, Deborah Masters, William Schuck. Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML,1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML(Guzzi, Roseann) (Entered: 05/26/2006)
06/12/2006	29	AFFIDAVIT in Opposition re 24 MOTION for Joinder of <i>Third Parties</i> filed by all plaintiffs. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A pt 1 of 3# 2 Exhibit A pt 2 of 3# 3 Exhibit A pt 3 of 3# 4 Exhibit B pt 1 of 4# 5 Exhibit B pt 2 of 4# 6 Exhibit B pt 3 of 4# 7 Exhibit B pt 4 of 4# 8 Exhibit C# 9 Exhibit D pt 1 of 2# 10 Exhibit D pt 2 of 2# 11 Exhibit E# 12 Exhibit F# 13 Exhibit G# 14 Exhibit H# 15 Exhibit I# 16 Exhibit J# 17 Exhibit K# 18 Exhibit L# 19 Exhibit M# 20 Exhibit N# 21 Exhibit O# 22 Exhibit P# 23 Exhibit Q# 24 Exhibit R# 25 Exhibit S)Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML,1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML(Estrin, Daniel) (Entered: 06/12/2006)
06/12/2006	30	RESPONSE to Motion re 24 MOTION for Joinder of <i>third parties</i> filed by all plaintiffs. Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML,1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML(Estrin, Daniel) (Entered: 06/12/2006)

06/22/2006	31	Letter <i>Request for Extension of Time to File Reply Brief</i> by Exxon Mobil Corporation. (Attachments: # 1 Affidavit Certificate of Service)Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML,1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML(Tenenbaum, Ellen) (Entered: 06/22/2006)
06/23/2006		ORDER granting 27 Motion for Leave to File. Ordered by JudgeRobert M. Levy on 6/23/06. (Levy, Robert) (Entered: 06/23/2006)
06/23/2006		ORDER re 31 Letter filed by Exxon Mobil Corporation. Application GRANTED. Exxon's Reply shall be filed on or before 6/28/06 . Ordered by Judge Robert M. Levy on 6/23/06. Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML,1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML(Levy, Robert) (Entered: 06/23/2006)
06/26/2006	32	Letter <i>Application to Magistrate Judge Levy for permission for law student to appear and argue in opposition to defendant's motion to compel joinder</i> by Teresa Toro, Riverkeeper, Inc., Rolf Carle, Laura Hoffman, Deborah Masters, William Schuck. Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML,1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML(Estrin, Daniel) (Entered: 06/26/2006)
06/27/2006		ORDER. Plaintiffs' application to permit Eric Annes, a law graduate sitting for the bar and a former student in the Pace Environmental Litigation Clinic, to argue in opposition to defendant's motion to compel joinder of certain third parties, is GRANTED . Ordered by Judge Robert M. Levy on 6/27/06. Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML,1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML(Levy, Robert) (Entered: 06/27/2006)
06/28/2006	33	REPLY to Response to Motion re 24 MOTION for Joinder filed by Exxon Mobil Corporation. Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML,1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML(Tenenbaum, Ellen) (Entered: 06/28/2006)
06/28/2006	34	AFFIDAVIT in Support re 24 MOTION for Joinder / <i>Declaration of Brian A. McGill in Support of Exxon Mobil Corporation's Reply in Support of its Motion to Compel the Joinder of Certain Necessary Parties Pursuant to Fed.R.Civ.P. 19</i> filed by Exxon Mobil Corporation. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A# 2 Exhibit B)Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML,1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML(Tenenbaum, Ellen) (Entered: 06/28/2006)
06/30/2006	35	SEALED ENVELOPE. Sealed by RML on 6/27/06. (Vaughn, Terry) (Entered: 06/30/2006)
07/13/2006	36	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Robert M. Levy : Status Conference held on 7/13/2006. Appearances for the parties noted on the record. Oral argument held on joinder motion. Descion reserved. Next

		Conf. set for 9/13/06 at 11:30 a.m. by telephone. Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML,1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML(Permaul, Jenny) (Entered: 07/17/2006)
07/26/2006	37	TRANSCRIPT of Civil Cause for Oral Argument held on 7/13/06 before Judge Levy. Counsel present for parties. Transcription Co.: Fiore Transcription Service, Inc. Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML,1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML(Fernandez, Erica) (Entered: 07/27/2006)
08/10/2006	38	REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS re 24 MOTION for Joinder filed by Exxon Mobil Corporation: For the reasons stated in this document, it is respectfully recommended that Exxon's motion to join BP and Texaco be denied without prejudice Ordered by Judge Robert M. Levy on 8/4/06. Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML,1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML(Permaul, Jenny) (Entered: 08/11/2006)
09/13/2006		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Robert M. Levy: Daniel Estrin, Matthew Brinckerhoff; Ellen Tennenbaum. New discovery schedule entered: 3/31/07 close of fact discovery; 5/18/07 simultaneous expert disclosure; 6/29/07 simultaneous expert rebuttal; 8/1/07 simultaneous expert replies; 10/26/07 close of expert discovery. Subject to Judge Amon's rules and approval, if necessary, dispositive motions to be served by 12/14/07. Regular status conferences will be held quarterly. Next conference 1/18/07 at 2:00.Status Conference held on 9/13/2006. (Tape #11:37.) Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML,1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML(Levy, Robert) (Entered: 09/13/2006)
09/14/2006	39	ORDER adopting Report and Recommendations denying Defendant's 24 Motion for Joinder without prejudice. Ordered by Judge Carol B. Amon on 09/14/06. (Kelleher, Finnuala) (Entered: 09/14/2006)
09/14/2006		ORDER adopting Report and Recommendations as to 38 Report and Recommendations.. Ordered by JudgeCarol B. Amon on 9/14/06. (Permaul, Jenny) (Entered: 09/14/2006)
01/12/2007	40	MOTION to Adjourn Conference by Exxon Mobil Corporation, Exxon Mobil Corporation. Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML, 1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML (Calandra, John) (Entered: 01/12/2007)
01/16/2007		ORDER granting (40) Motion to Adjourn Conference in case 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML; granting (22) Motion to Adjourn Conference in case 1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML. The January 18, 2007 conference is adjourned to February 9, 2007 at 11:00 a.m. Counsel may contact chambers to see whether earlier dates become available. Ordered by JudgeRobert M. Levy on 1/16/07. (Levy, Robert) (Entered: 01/16/2007)

02/09/2007		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Robert M. Levy : Daniel Estrin, Matthew Brinckerhoff; John Calandra, David Crump (pro hac vice). Parties agree that the landscape of this case will change when New York State files suit in approximately 90 days, raising same or similar issues. The parties shall advise chambers shortly as to which of the suggested March conference dates is workable. A representative of the Attorney General's office is invited to attend. The court requests that counsel communicate this invitation. The March 31, 2007 discovery deadline is extended to a date to be set after the next conference. Status Conference held on 2/9/2007 Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML, 1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML (Levy, Robert) (Entered: 02/09/2007)
02/13/2007	41	Letter <i>re: Scheduling of Next Status Conference</i> by Teresa Toro, Riverkeeper, Inc., Rolf Carle, Laura Hoffman, Deborah Masters, William Schuck Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML, 1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML (Estrin, Daniel) (Entered: 02/13/2007)
03/22/2007	42	Letter <i>requesting adjournment of status conference</i> by Exxon Mobil Corporation (Calandra, John) (Entered: 03/22/2007)
03/22/2007		ORDER Re: Docket Entry #42 - Letter requesting adjournment of status conference by Exxon Mobil Corporation. Application granted. Conference adjourned to Friday, May 18, 2007 at 11:00 a.m. Ordered by Judge Robert M. Levy on 3/22/07. (Marino, Janine) (Entered: 03/22/2007)
03/26/2007	43	Letter dtd 3-13-07 From Robert Emmet Hernan to Judge Levy regarding the status conference scheduled (Sica, Michele) (Entered: 03/26/2007)
04/13/2007	44	Notice of MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice , <i>as to David O'Neal Crump</i> , by Exxon Mobil Corporation. (Attachments: # 1 Receipt for Payment) (Barrett, C) (Entered: 04/20/2007)
04/20/2007	45	ORDER granting the 44 Motion for Leave to Appear pro hac vice as to David O'Neal Crump. Ordered by Judge Robert M. Levy, on 4/19/2007. (Barrett, C) (Entered: 04/20/2007)
05/16/2007	46	Letter MOTION to Adjourn Conference <i>With Consent of All Parties</i> by Teresa Toro, Riverkeeper, Inc., Rolf Carle, Laura Hoffman, Deborah Masters, William Schuck. Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML, 1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML (Estrin, Daniel) (Entered: 05/16/2007)
05/17/2007		ORDER granting (46) Motion to Adjourn Conference in case 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML; granting (24) Motion to Adjourn Conference in case 1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML. The conference scheduled for 5/17/07 is

		adjourned to June 27, 2007 at 2:15. Ordered by JudgeRobert M. Levy on 5/17/07. (Levy, Robert) (Entered: 05/17/2007)
05/24/2007	47	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice by Exxon Mobil Corporation. (Attachments: # 1 Certificate of Service) (Hall, Michael) (Entered: 05/24/2007)
05/25/2007		ORDER granting, subject to payment of \$25 fee to the Clerk of Court, (47) Motion for Leave to Appear pro hac vice in case 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML. Ordered by JudgeRobert M. Levy on 5/25/07. (Levy, Robert) (Entered: 05/25/2007)
05/30/2007	48	Notice of MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice <i>as to Sarah Elizabeth Hancur</i> by Exxon Mobil Corporation. (Attachments: # 1 Affidavit In Support-Mtn. for Pro Hac Vice# 2 Receipt of Payment-Pro Hac Vice) (Layne, Monique) (Entered: 06/19/2007)
05/30/2007		FILING FEE: \$25.00, receipt number 339686. (Layne, Monique) (Entered: 06/19/2007)
06/19/2007	49	ORDER, granting 48 Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice/Admitting Sarah Elizabeth Hancur to Practice Pro Hac Vice in the above-captioned matter. The atty admitted pro hac vice must serve a copy of this Order on all other counsel in this case. (So Ordered by Judge Carol B. Amon on 6/12/2007). (Layne, Monique) (Entered: 06/19/2007)
06/25/2007	50	Letter MOTION to Adjourn Conference <i>on consent of all parties</i> by Teresa Toro, Riverkeeper, Inc., Rolf Carle, Laura Hoffman, Deborah Masters, William Schuck. Associated Cases: 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML, 1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML (Estrin, Daniel) (Entered: 06/25/2007)
06/26/2007		ORDER granting (50) Motion to Adjourn Conference in case 1:04-cv-02056-CBA-RML; granting (29) Motion to Adjourn Conference in case 1:05-cv-05229-CBA-RML, as the Attorney General requires additional time to advise the court of his intentions with respect to the notices of intent to sue served upon defendant. The June 27, 2007 conference is adjourned to July 23, 2007 at 9:30. Ordered by JudgeRobert M. Levy on 6/26/07. (Levy, Robert) (Entered: 06/26/2007)